

KINGS LAW REPORTS

(ALL SC/NOVEL CA)

(2000) KLR VOL 6 PART 107 pp. 2187 - 2448

JUNE 2000

Dedicated to the King of kings

O. O. NOEL ESQ. Chief Editor

INDEX OF CASES REPORTED

JUNE CONTD.

11. Owodunni v. Registered Trustees of Celestial Church of Christ p. 2187
12. Olohunde v. Adeyoju p. 2255
13. Eze v. Atasie p. 2301
14. Psychiatric Hospital Management Board v. Ejitagha p. 2323
15. Elema v. Akenzua p. 2345
16. Adesanya v. Aderonmu p. 2367
17. Cotia Commercio Exportacao E Importacao S.A. v. Sanusi Brothers (Nigeria) Ltd p. 2395
18. Brawal Shipping (Nigeria) Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd p. 2417

ii **INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2000) 6 KLR**

ACTIONS - Claim - Debt - Defence - It is not enough for the defendant to show a case of hardship - Nor a mere inability to pay. *Cotia Importacao S.A. v. Sanusi Bros.* p. 2395

ACTIONS - Claim - Specially endorsed writ - Defence - Legal Objection - Where legal objection is raised - The fact and the point of law arising therefrom - Must be clearly and adequately stated *Cotia Importacao S.A. v. Sanusi Bros.* p. 2395

ACTIONS - Locus standi - What the term denotes *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

APPEALS - Concurrent findings - Wrong conclusion - Where there is no support for the findings of the trial court - And the Court of Appeal reached a wrong conclusion in the matter - The findings would not rise to the effect of concurrent findings. *Eze v. Atasie* p. 2301

APPEALS - Court of Appeal - Issues - Duty to make pronouncement on all issues placed before it. *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

APPEALS - Court of Appeal - Issues - When the court may not pronounce on all the issues placed before it. *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

APPEALS - Ground of appeal - Issues - Not based on any ground of appeal - The court would have acted in error if it has countenanced those issues *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

APPEALS - Issues - Abstract issues - Are of no use in an appeal *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

APPEALS - Trial Court - Discretion - Exercise of - Circumstances when an appellate court would question - The exercise of discretion of a trial judge. *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

CARRIAGE OF GOODS - Bill of lading - Demurrer - Good defence - When a plaintiff can rely on a demurrer procedure as to whether a good defence has been disclosed *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

CARRIAGE OF GOODS - Bill of lading - Indorsement simpliciter - Implication of such an indorsement *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

CARRIAGE OF GOODS - Bill of lading - Locus standi - Demurrer - When it would be appropriate for a defendant to demur on the locus standi of the plaintiff *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

CARRIAGE OF GOODS - Bill of lading - Property in the goods - Passes not by the mere assignment and delivery of the bill of lading - But by the contract between the assignor and the assignee *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

CARRIAGE OF GOODS - Bills of lading - Indorsement - Where the stamp of a third party appears on the bills but without the appropriate words to qualify it as an Indorsement in full - It cannot be concluded that the third party is an indorsee of the bills *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

CARRIAGE OF GOODS - Carriage by sea - Contract - Privity - Bill of lading - *Adesanya* case - The principle in that case - Is that a person who is not a party to a contract of carriage of goods evidenced by a bill of lading - Cannot sue in reliance on that bill. *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

COURTS - Discretion - Declaration of right - The grant of a declaration of right is at the discretion of the court - But it is a discretion that must be exercised judicially. *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

iv **INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2000) 6 KLR**

COURTS - Discretion - Interference with - Where the trial judge acted judicially and judiciously - It will be improper to interfere with the exercise of his discretion *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

DEMURRER - Irregular procedure - Taking of evidence - Any procedure adopted which involved the taking or assessing of evidence - Would be irregular *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

DEMURRER - Pleading - Documents that are pleaded - If exhibited to make them part of the pleading for the purpose of demurrer proceeding - That approach would radically change the demurrer principle - Of relying on the statement of claim alone *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

DEMURRER - Principle of - A defendant is neither permitted to file a Statement of defence nor to tender evidence - He is taken to have accepted all the facts pleaded by the plaintiff - But rely on some point of law *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

EQUITY - Equitable defence - Acquiescence - Void act - Where the act complained of is void - Acquiescence by the complainant would not clothe it with validity. *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

EVIDENCE - Affidavit - Conflict - Where the facts pleaded have been adequately supported by relevant documentary evidence - It does not require the calling of oral evidence - To resolve the conflict in the affidavit evidence *Cotia Importacao S.A. v. Sanusi Bros.* p. 2395

EVIDENCE - Pleading - Evidence which is at variance with the pleading - Goes to no issue *Eze v. Atasie* p. 2301

EVIDENCE - Pleadings - Evidence - Which is at variance with the pleadings - Goes to no issue. *Olohunde v. Adeyoju* p. 2255

EVIDENCE - Proof - Burden of proof - While the burden of proof initially lies on the plaintiff - The proof or rebuttal of issues may shift as the case progresses Elema v. Akenzua p. 2345

EVIDENCE - Sale of land - Purchase receipt and survey plan - Comparison of purchase receipt and Survey plan to ascertain the boundaries of the land sold - Is wrong Adesanya v. Aderonmu p. 2367

EVIDENCE - Unchallenged evidence - Attitude of the court - To such evidence. Olohunde v. Adeyoju p. 2255

JUDGMENTS - Claim - Evidence - Uncontroverted evidence - Where the plaintiff's claim by the pleadings and evidence remained uncontroverted - He is entitled to judgment Elema v. Akenzua p. 2345

JUDGMENTS - Evidence - Pleadings - Where the plaintiff adduced no evidence - As to the root of title he pleaded - His case ought to have been dismissed. Olohunde v. Adeyoju p. 2255

JUDGMENTS - Findings - Unsupported by any legal evidence - Is perverse and erroneous - And cannot be allowed to stand. Olohunde v. Adeyoju p. 2255

LANDLAW - Boundaries of land - Common boundary - Where the parties own land along a common boundary - It is necessary to show and prove the precise boundary features along the common boundary. Adesanya v. Aderonmu p. 2367

LAND LAW - Boundaries of land - How proved - The precise identity and extent of the land claimed may be established - By oral description of the land in dispute - Or by filing and tendering an accurate survey plan of the land Adesanya v. Aderonmu p. 2367

LAND LAW - Boundaries of land - Onus of proof -The onus is on the

plaintiff who seeks a declaration of title and or injunction - To show clearly the area of land to which his claims relate *Adesanya v. Aderonmu* p. 2367

LAND LAW - Boundaries of the land - Before a declaration of title to land is given - The first duty of the claimant is to establish - The area of land to which his claim relates *Adesanya v. Aderonmu* p. 2367

LAND LAW - Equitable interest - Sale of land - Contract of - Where a person entered into a property under a contract of sale - He has acquired an equitable interest in the land - Which may be converted into a legal estate by specific performance *Elema v. Akenzua* p. 2345

LAND LAW - Evidence - Declaration of title to land - Claim for - A plaintiff must succeed on the strength of his own case - And not on the weakness of the defendant's case - Unless the defendant's case support that of the Plaintiff *Adesanya v. Aderonmu* p. 2367

LAND LAW - Identity of land - And accuracy of the survey plan - Where these are not in dispute - The plaintiff will not need to prove the boundaries of the land *Adesanya v. Aderonmu* p. 2367

LAND LAW - Injunction - Boundaries of land - An order of injunction cannot be made in respect of an area of land - Whose boundaries are not properly identified *Adesanya v. Aderonmu* p. 2367

LAND LAW - Land Use Act - Certificate of occupancy - Deemed to be defective - Where a certificate of occupancy has been granted to one of two claimants - Who has not proved a better title - It must be deemed to be defective - And against the spirit of the Act. *Olohunde v. Adeyoju* p. 2255

LAND LAW - Land Use Act - Certificate of occupancy - Effect of - It is not a conclusive evidence of any right, interest or valid title to land - In favour of the grantee. *Olohunde v. Adeyoju* p. 2255

LAND LAW - Land Use Act - Certificate of occupancy - Onus of proof
- The onus is on the grantee of such certificate - To establish that the land was vested in him - Before the commencement of the Act Olohunde v. Adeyoju p. 2255

LAND LAW - Land Use Act - Certificate of occupancy - Validity - Condition for the validity of a certificate of occupancy issued under the Act Olohunde v. Adeyoju p. 2255

LAND LAW - Land Use Act - Statutory right of occupancy - Deemed holder - A plaintiff who failed to establish that he had any right to a land in dispute - Cannot be deemed a holder of a statutory right of occupancy - Under section 34 of the Act. Olohunde v. Adeyoju p. 2255

LAND LAW - Native law and custom - Sale of land - Requirements of a valid sale of land - Under native law and custom Elema v. Akenzua p. 2345

LAND LAW - Purchase receipt - Admissibility - Purchase receipt is admissible in evidence as a mere receipt - And not in proof of title to land Adesanya v. Aderonmu p. 2367

LAND LAW - Right of occupancy - Declaration of title - In granting a declaration of title over some land - The trial judge must confine himself to ascertaining the area - In respect of which the plaintiff has discharged his onus of proving title. Adesanya v. Aderonmu p. 2367

LAND LAW - Sale - Contract of - Purchase receipt - Effect of - Purchase receipt is an acknowledgement of the payment of money - And coupled with the plaintiff being in possession - Raised a presumption that he entered into possession - Under a contract of sale. Elema v. Akenzua p. 2345

LAND LAW - Sale - Customary law - A written contract is not necessary to effect a valid sale - Payment of the purchase price coupled with delivery

of possession of the land - Creates a valid sale *Adesanya v. Aderonmu* p. 2367

LAND LAW - Survey plan - Joining of issues - Where a defendant is desirous of joining issue with any aspect of a plaintiff's survey plan in respect of a land in dispute - What such a defendant must do. *Adesanya v. Aderonmu* p. 2367

LAND LAW - Title - Claim for declaration of title - A plaintiff in such a claim must succeed on the strength of his case. *Eze v. Atasie* p. 2301

LAND LAW - Title to land - Claim for - Declaration of title - What the plaintiff must establish - In order to succeed in such a claim. *Adesanya v. Aderonmu* p. 2367

LAND LAW - Title to land - Evidence of possession - Where a plaintiff has failed to prove title - It may be necessary to consider the evidence of possession - In order to ascertain whether he is entitled to damages and injunction - Claimed for in the alleged trespass. *Eze v. Atasie* p. 2301

LAND LAW - Title to land - Occupation and possession of land - Better title - The law will ascribe possession or occupation - To the person who proves a better title. *Olohunde v. Adeyoju* p. 2255

LAND LAW - Title to land - Onus of proof - The onus lies on the plaintiff to satisfy the court - That he is entitled on the evidence brought 'by him to the declaration of title he claimed *Olohunde v. Adeyoju* p. 2255

LAND LAW - Title to land - Root of title - Once a party traces his root of title to a particular source - To succeed he must also establish the title of that person or source - From whom he claims to have derived title. *Olohunde v. Adeyoju* p. 2255

LAND LAW - Title to land - Root of title - Once a party pleads and traces

his root of title to a particular source - And the averment is challenged - What that party must establish in order to succeed *Adesanya v. Aderonmu* p. 2367

LAND LAW - Title to land - Traditional history - Consequence of reliance on - Where a plaintiff by his pleading and evidence relies on traditional history - For his root of title to land - He fails or succeeds on that history. *Eze v. Atasie* p. 2301

LAND LAW - Title to land - Traditional history - Proof - The pleading of the devolution and the evidence in support - Must be reliable and credible. *Eze v. Atasie* p. 2301

LAND LAW - Title to land - Traditional history - The rule in *Kojo II v. Bonsie* - Where there is a failure to present a reliable account - Of the founding and devolution of the land in dispute - The rule will not apply. *Eze v. Atasie* p. 2301

LAND LAW - Title to land - Traditional history - Where evidence of traditional history is found and accepted by the Court to be cogent - It is sufficient to support a claim for declaration of title to land *Adesanya v. Aderonmu* p. 2367

LAND LAW - Trespass and injunction - Title to land - Whenever a claim for trespass is coupled with a claim for an injunction - The title of the parties to the land in dispute is automatically put in issue. *Olohunde v. Adeyoju* p. 2255

LAND LAW - Trespass - Possession - Title to land - Where two parties are on land claiming possession - Trespass can only be at the suit of that party - Who can show that title of the land is in him. *Olohunde v. Adeyoju* p. 2255

LOCUS STANDI - Constitution of 1979 - Provisions of section 6 (6) (b) - Interpretation of - In Adesanya case - That case did not decide that the subsection prescribes the locus standi of a litigant - But that it prescribes the extent of the judicial powers of the courts. *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

LOCUS STANDI - Declaratory reliefs - Sufficient interest - A plaintiff who only claims declaratory reliefs - If he shows sufficient interest in the subject matter of the dispute - Has the necessary locus standi to prosecute the claim. *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

LOCUS STANDI - Demurrer application - Carriage by sea - Bill of lading - Where the averment in the statement of claim shows that the plaintiff has a right to sue on the bill of lading - And that the defendants failed to meet the claims of the plaintiff - The plaintiff has locus standi to sue - And the demurrer proceeding ought to fail *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

LOCUS STANDI - Demurrer - Bill of lading - Property in the goods - Where the property in the goods has not passed to a third party - The plaintiff has locus standi *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

LOCUS STANDI - Lack of - Consequence - Where a Plaintiff has no Locus standi - It is not necessary to consider whether there is a genuine case on the merits *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

LOCUS STANDI - Private law - Cause of action - In Private law the question of locus standi - Is merged in the issue of cause of action. *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

LOCUS STANDI - Public right - Justiciable interest - For a person to invoke judicial power to determine the constitutionality of legislative or executive action - He must show that he has justiciable interest - Which may be affected by the action *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

LOCUS STANDI - Question of - Yard stick in determining - The interest or injury test should remain the yardstick in determining the question of the locus standi of a complainant - And the test is not affected by section 6(6)(b) of the Constitution. *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

MASTER & SERVANT - Public servant - Pensions Act, 1979 - A person employed in the Psychiatric Hospital - Is a public servant subject to the Act. *Psychiatric Hospital v. Ejitagha* p. 2323

MASTER & SERVANT - Retirement - Burden of proof - Pensions Act, 1979 - Provisions of section 4 - The burden is on the employer to show that the provisions were complied with. *Psychiatric Hospital v. Ejitagha* p. 2323

MASTER & SERVANT - Retirement - Pensions Act, 1979 - Section 4 thereof - Three conditions that must be satisfied - Before an officer can be retired under subsection (2) *Psychiatric Hospital v. Ejitagha* p. 2323

MASTER & SERVANT - Retirement - Statutory Powers - Under section 4 (2) of the Pensions Act - A public Body invested with statutory Powers - Must act within the law. *Psychiatric Hospital v. Ejitagha* p. 2323

PLEADINGS - Document - Evidence - When a document is Pleaded it forms part of the pleading - And the document will be tendered as the evidence in proof of those facts. *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Claim - Order 10 Proceedings - The essence of proceedings under Order 10 - Is to give judgment for admitted claim. *Cotia Importacao S.A. v. Sanusi Bros.* p. 2395

SUCCESSION - Corporate body - Religious organization - Pastor - Successor to the office of - Where the constitution of the organization

xii INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2000) 6 KLR

contains express provision - For the appointment of a successor to the office - Any method of succession contrary to the provision is void. *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

SUMMARY JUDGMENTS - Claim - Specially endorsed writ - Statement of defence - The fact that a defendant has served a statement of defence - Can only be sufficient to allow him to defend the claim - If it is not a sham defence. *Cotia Importacao S.A. v. Sanusi Bros.* p. 2395

SUMMARY JUDGMENTS - Specially endorsed writ - Defence on the merit - Defendant's affidavit - Must as far as possible deal specifically with the plaintiff's claim - And should also clearly and concisely state what the defence is. *Cotia Importacao S.A. v. Sanusi Bros.* p. 2395

TRESPASS - Damages - Action for - Only a person in possession of land in dispute at the material time - Can maintain an action for damages for trespass. *Olohunde v. Adeyoju* p. 2255

WORDS & PHRASES - "Amendment" - What the word means *Owodunni v. Celestial Church* p. 2187

WORDS & PHRASES - "Indorsement in blank" - And "Indorsement in full" - What they mean *Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd* p. 2417

INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES

Bill of lading Act 1855 of England; s. 1 Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd p. 2417

Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1979; s.6 (6) (b) Owodunni v. Celestial Church p. 2187

Evidence Act, S. 131 (now S. 132) Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd p. 2417

High Court of Lagos (Civil Procedure) Rules, 1972; Ord. 10 rule 1 Cotia Importacao S.A. v. Sanusi Bros. p. 2395

High Court of Lagos State (Civil Procedure) Rules 1973; O. 22 r. 5 Owodunni v. Celestial Church p. 2187

Land Use Act, Cap. 202, Laws of the Federation of Nigeria, 1990; ss. 34 and 51(1) Olohunde v. Adeyoju p. 2255

Merchant Shipping Act, Cap. 224 Laws of the Federation, 1990; S. 375 (1) Brawal Ltd v. F.I. Onwadike Co. Ltd p. 2417

Pensions Act, 1979 (Formerly Decree No. 102 of 1979); S. 4 Psychiatric Hospital v. Ejitaga p. 2323

Psychiatric Hospital Management Board Act, 1979 (Formerly Decree No. 92 of 1979); s.13 Psychiatric Hospital v. Ejitaga p. 2323

Supreme Court Act; s. 22 Owodunni v. Celestial Church p. 2187